Comments on DMAW 2010

Speakers were asked Comments and feedback on the Reference Presentation, the Talk, and the Initiative itself.

every paragraph comes from a different speaker

It was fun and interesting! Lots of discussion.

Educational and interesting.

We did it quite well . Around 70 percent of all people working at the institure (including PhD students) attended the seminar. After the seminar we had a short discussion on some issues related to recent results of cosmological simulations on galactic scales.

My seminar was useful in terms of explain to latest advancements about dark matter

It was fun

Especially the students were very interested and asked a lot of questions. I would say that the seminar was definitely a success.

I spoke only for half an hour, since this is the tuesday after lunch 'coffee club'. Half of the attendants normally don't come to this kind of seminar, so don't be surprised about the numbers: it is twice the average. There were a number of questions, in particular about the debate in Germany (White vs. Kroupa).

Many questions about the ultimate reasons for invoking DMAW.

too many slides; took me >1.5hours, many questions

The number of slides was high. Besides that all was OK, I think it was interesting for people listening about galaxies!

Wonderful!

The seminar was announced in the sciences faculty and attracted many students and professors. The initiative is very interesting, but the scope of the template talk is too specialized. I suggest a more general approach to the dark matter problem and more freedom to prepare the talk so that people can also focus in their field (simulation, direct detection, indirect detection, etc). That would allow to reach also other audiences.

A very nice initiative, people here were happy to hear a review talk on this extremely important topic. Thanks for the idea of organizing this.

The talk went well, there was a high fraction of young researchers

Great iniciative. It should be repeated next year.

Had to adapt the presentation, since the audience here is mostly high energy theorists - gave a more general talk on dark matter.

Everything went really well. With students and faculty what we did in the end is a little workshop. On wednesday and friday (1st and 3rd December) we gave a total of 10 talks, each of 10 minutes, going from dark-matter in galaxies to LSS, micro, weak, and strong lensing, and particle candidates, neutralinos (neutralinos in the LHC), gravitinos, etc. We even finished today with a DMAW2010 dinner.

The audience consisted of 26 participants (this is quite good for the Thursday seminar we usually have), and as you can see, most of the audience was young, mostly PhD students from all fields of Physics. The audience (part of which was facing first time the paradigm of dark matter) became interested and we got many questions, due to which we slightly overpassed the time normally allocated for the seminar.

There were about 30 persons in the lecture hall, as usually. The speaker is known from her skeptic approach to dark matter. Therefore, her words about the necessity of taking into account dark matter in our considerations sound very seriously. Therefore, I think that such Week is a very useful initiative. It allows to present physisists the importance of the subject.

The talk went very well.

The event went well and lots of questions and discussion. Members in the audience who work on MACHO experiments were disappointed that this was not discussed however. Thanks for organizing this event!

Lots of questions and interest at the end of the talk.

It went very well, even if it was interrupted by a fire alarm, and we all had to leave the building for 10 minutes. No fire though! my talk was in astro-tea Obviously I have to cut it down to a very few bare essentials, and then I gave a little summary of the latest results on Segue 1 - the darkest known galaxy.

I felt that the reference talk provided lacked clarity for a non-expert and was difficult to make sense of. The notes provided were helpful but also occasionally obtuse.

The seminar was received very well by an audience of about 35 people (among which some chemists, biologists and physicists of different interests). I believe the DM awareness in my country has been tremendously increased.

The seminar went well, there was a reasonable turn out despite it being a very busy week for seminars. I gave them lots of information with regards to galaxies. I used plenty of your slides, maybe 8 or so, so now you will be happy to learn that everybody knows that rotation curves are not flat! Then I did the second part focusing on DAMA and PAMELA and things like that.

It was ask me by the Director, due to the students great interest, to repeat the same seminar day after. As the new attendance was mainly non-graduated people I gave an introduction to the subject. It seems that it was gone very well. There were many questions during the two sessions.

it went very well, there were about 20 people, which is a very good score knowing that the snow has prevented several other researchers to come here last thrursday at the Observatoire. I prepared about 35 slides, for about 1 hour of presentation including questions and answers. Most questions were about the results of numerical simulations. Other people asked me about MOND, which was not developed during my talk. No questions were asked wrt to the direct and indirect detection methods of DM (exo)particles.

Positive, the people were highly unaware of results in DM studies

I just gave my seminar, to about 12 people (typical for our journal club).
The seminar was nice! People commented that is very nice sometimes to have a review of the current state of the art knowledge about dark matter.

I actually enjoyed embarrassing myself in front of the astrophysicists! Thanks for this opportunity, and I hope we have made a difference.
Participants appealed by the results emerging from new different astrophysical observations.
Interesting discussion after the seminar.
I only had 50' time, so many slides had to be skipped.
I had a lot of questions at the end and there was great interest in the initiative.

. Besides the colleagues and PhD students from our Institute of Astronomy there were colleagues from the University and other Institutes The seminar was successful, the interest was great, there were many questions.

everyone thought it was an interesting way to disseminate information. I used the circulated slides without modification but only had time to go through about 30% of the material. This was for a good reason, because people were interacting a lot. The general comments were that people thought, for non-cosmologists, the material on the slides was challenging; however, with me to guide them we made fairly good progress - at least through the early slides. (There was never going to be enough time to cover everything). People commented that they'd hoped there would be more material considering MOND, TeVeS and other non-standard models, i.e. to consider alternatives to DM. I pointed people towards some recent work in these areas.

The seminar was successful.

The talk raised an interesting debate afterwords, and the whole concept of this kind of seminar was generally approved. Next week we will even dedicate one of our Literature Meetings to a new discussion about dark matter (sort of a follow-up to the seminar)."
The DMAW seminar in Sternberg Astronomical Institute had passed successfully on December, 3. It included the review talks followed by three short presentations After that there was some discussion on the problem of the nature of dark matter. There were about seventy participants (including students), from several institutes. We thank SOC for the initiative to organize the DMAW.
Extremely Positive! Students and Researchers have been very satisfied!

A very great success,. None wanted to go home!

Excellent presentation! We spent about 75 minutes presenting the provided material and about 45 minutes providing a high-level overview of our own areas of study on dark matter.
The slides were far too technical for students, I had to select a small number and go trhough them slowly.

We encouraged physicists in addition to astronomers to attend, and instead of giving one talk we organised it as an informal mini-workshop. At some point we had very interesting discussions and different points of view, regarding dark matter candidates, alternative cosmologies, applications of lensing and dark matter large scale structure. We all agree the event was a success.
The awareness campaign on DMAW must exist every year.

The period for this activity is not particularly good, since it is in the examinations period. Many interested students could not attend because they have exams.

It was a very good initiative. The audience liked it.
"We had good discussions afterwards (which were even continued during the
lunch break!). I think that the DMAW is a great idea!"

All went smootly, a long discussion took place after the seminar not only employees but people from the faculty
Presentation modified (simplified) to attend under graduated students.40 under graduated students, ~4 graduetad(pós), 4 professors.

Several questions asked during the presentation, which is always a good sign. Being mostly a Physics department, there was lots of interests in the last part of the presentation, where possible direct (and indirect) detections of dark matter is discussed. Overall, it was successful.

The initiative was very well received and the seminar was a great success! Thank you for your effort!

It generated a lot of discussion on the subject of detection in special, as many of the peoples in the Institute are involved in observation missions like Planck or Antares and in experiments, like LHC from CERN.
it went really well, people were quite interested. Though we've used a significantly shorter version of the lecture, it was quite useful. It's quite unfamiliar topic to most people here. so many ideas were quite new to them. Anyway thanks for creating such event

More theory in the slides would have been nice.
Time limited for disucssion, but 4-5 good questions
So many interesting questions and feedbacks ! Great experience.

This seminar is hepfull in increasing the knowledge of dark matter for PhD students.
It is a good start for me as a phd student to organize a small scale seminar. Feedback from the audience is very good but the content of slides presentation are quite heavy for them since research on Dark Matter is really new in my country.
People asked many questions. Something like "What do we know about physical properties of dark

matter?", - Next to nothing. It is great idea to prepare such event because many people interested in dark matter and like to be tuned on it.
The seminar was a success in my opinion! A regular seminar here attracts about 20-25 people every week. However, for the DMAW seminar there were more than 30-35 people in the room, and 15-17 more people following the event by streaming all the time. In addition, there were a lot of questions at the end of the talk, which indeed took all the available time up. think it was very good.

Everything was ok . A lot of discussion! It was very interesting and useful.

A lot of questions

Thank you for your effort. The seminar went very well and it was very interesting to all. This is really an exciting subject in physics. We will include Dark matter seminars in our regular seminars as most people demanded.this is reaaly an exciting topic in physics, we are planning to give other seminars by the begining of year 2011.

Everything went fine in my talk and I got a good feeling from the people (people liked it!).

People thought the version of the millenium simulation video was a little "cheesy".

The experience was positive. More introductory slides might have helped.

"The seminar was very nice, there were around 30 persons and very interested. In particular, the interest was very high on the DM dynamics (above all halos formation) and on the DM direct and indirect searches. Also, some questions about DM alternatives arose. It was a positive experience, and I think this is an excellent initiative to spread out information about DM to the scientific community that do not work on that. Unfortunately, there is a lot of prejudice in the scientific community on DM, mainly due to ignorance. Thanks for organization!"

Nice event!

It was an excellent idea. This should be repeated, and not only in this area. The professors and students found it excellent.The conference was very nice: students, professors, and non academic people came to our auditorium. It was excellent to discuss these new ideas among us.

Most attendees were students, a mixture of undergraduates and graduates, in the various areas of Physics. Some of them saw the seminar as a good opportunity to ask basic questions about dark matter, and to have a more accurate picture about this problem in Cosmology. After the talk, at least two students showed interest to consider Cosmology for a thesis program once the time comes for that. Lot of interest generated among the students after the exposure.

It was a great success. I repeat the talk at the Instituto de Física y Matemáticas and again, it was a great success. Congratulations for the organizers.

People took the initiative with a lot of enthusiasm and are looking forward to the second part. I have presented the materials up to the end of the dSphs. This took nearly one hour and I have removed quite some slides. It certainly needs at least two hours of seminar. Suggestions were: 1) a bit more on the TF

would be beneficial; 2) more material on galaxy clusters; 3) one slide to treat MOND, even to explain why it does not work.

Great initiave...keep up pushing it!

great success

The talk has been given last Tuesday (7, December) and was very successful. It has been attended by about 30 people. Besides the local staff, several colleagues from other institutes in Athens came, as well as undergraduate and postgraduate students from the University. I think this is a good score, taking into account, that there was a day that buses etc. were on strike. The whole event lasted about 1.5 hour. The slides presented were a combination of the material you have sent us and slides we added Congratulations again for the nice idea you had!

Compliments . This initiative will have great impact !!

Not easy to find an equilibrium between specialists and physicists working in different fields

Wonderful idea and honored take part

This initiative has been well accepted within the university community. The audience was quite broad, from undergraduate students to professors.

The seminar was presented to the undergraduate students of our institution. An interesting fact was that people from the staff (non physicists) were also present and enjoyed the talk as well!
Unfortunately the date of the seminar is out of term, therefore the attendance was small, most of the audience were researches and few students. Most of the comments were constructive.

The seminar was productive in views and reinforce theoretical concepts. Half of the attendees were students, contributing to the disclosure of a subject as interesting as the dark matter. I thank the organizing committee for their hospitality and for providing great material

It was a good idea, but in the future one should aim at a broader audience. We learned a lot -- especially on the spirals. I was not aware that it is now clear that NFW does not fit the observations in the inner part of spirals. That was the main thing I learned, besides the impression that rotation curves and their interpretation is much more complicated than some textbooks want us to believe.
Copies of talk were requested. One person liked "the very soft introduction" to the topic. The seminar was attended by solid state and biophysics people, who found it interesting too.

Presentation contained lots of information on so many different fields. I am very grateful to use it. It was quite stunning to see the connection from astronomy to particle physics.Still, I'm very glad that we participated at the DMAW. It was very interesting for all of us and we learned much more about it. Also thanks for organizing everything and promoting the initiate to the so many different institutes.

Problmes with errors on the slides, and lack of discussion about DM in clusters of galaxies.

There has been a quite lively discussion, mainly on possible alternative explanations of the small scale DM phenomenology as galactic rotation curves, and on the chances of wek lensing studies to break this degeneracy.

It went very well! There was about 50 people -- a lot for a colloquium-- and many questions.Besides, there were 2 interviews in astronomy.fm (o about the DM awareness day

The initiative was fully appreciated and I think it was very useful especially for PhD students

I received many questions

I got a lot of interesting questions

I think the seminar as captured the attention of most partecipants. Many questions have been asked during the talk and a deep discussion mainly about indirect methods to search for dark matter has followed the seminar.

It was an excelent idea, because this is an object that attract the people interest, and this type of event could be realized frequently
People are very interested about Drak Matter and Astrophysics, in general. It is a good event and many such events could be organized about other topics in Astrophysics. The number of attendee could have been more if the week had been organized before December since the winter vacation starts in December.

Wonderful organization

Very excellent initiative Students were very partecipative I also learned a lot ...
All enjoyed it ! Lots of questions at the end and in general very good reaction about that dark... splendid initiative ...

A huge interest on the subject. The seminar has been announced to all scientists in my country

Very good idea

We tailored the talks for a broader audience to highlight various aspects of dark matter research. The turn out was very good and the audience was very interested.

The seminar was in the framwork of our particle physics seminar. The material provided by the DMAW organizers was very specialized for astronomers. It was less effort to learn something on my own and give a seminar about DM emphasizing the particle physics aspects. There were many questions and discussions. Luckily, also two astronomers were present, who had given a DMAW seminar at the institute of astronomy, who could answer a many questions.